A partnership in progress

Bicultural relationships in the Aotearoa New Zealand counselling setting—A critical systematic literature review

Anna Reeves

Abstract

This systematic literature review focused on the relationship between Euro-Western perspectives and local indigenous (Māori) perspectives of counselling in the context of Aotearoa New Zealand. Twenty-five publications were identified which offered insights into the movement of the counselling profession towards engagement in effective bicultural relationships. Though some convergence appears to be occurring, the review also asked: What are the gaps? Does the still-prevailing Euro-Western approach to theory, education and practice create barriers to meeting the needs of a large Māori client base, and if so, how might this be remedied? The overall findings recommend the field of counselling continues to undertake robust self-review in order to engage more meaningfully with those who identify as Māori. Recommendations for future research include consideration of how helpful ideas and concepts could be more fully utilised to provide appropriate services for a diverse local population.

Keywords: biculturalism, Māori, counselling, indigenous, bicultural relationships

In the social landscape of Aotearoa New Zealand, culture is significant. There are two main groups, based loosely on culture, that have been constructed in the national consciousness in a binary opposition (Crocket, 2009). One group is based on the power and rule of the British Crown, for which the term Euro-Western is used in reference to its epistemological basis. The other group is termed "Māori," and is representative of the iwi, hapū, pan-tribal and urban groups that comprise the indigenous population (Royal Commission on Social Policy, 1988). The viewpoints of each group are underpinned by different sets of ideas (Salmond, 2017); two different worldviews, based on science and indigenous knowledge

(Niania, Bush, & Epston, 2017). It should be noted that neither is a separate, static, or unchanging entity (Crocket, 2012), but each moves and shifts in relationship with the other. Also, people here in Aotearoa are diverse—a mosaic of individuals interrelated by blood, shared meanings, similarities, and differences. Each of us is located at a slightly different position on a continuum of cultural experience, knowledge, identification, and understanding (Brown, Clark, Gilling, & Waitere, 2008). Many people have identified positive ways in which ideas and practices drawn from both Euro-Western and indigenous systems of meaning can be put together. As Mason Durie reflects in his foreword to Niania et al. (2017, p. iii), "when [science and indigenous knowledge] are applied together, the divergence [between the two] can be replaced by a synergy that dwarfs the scope of either acting alone."

From a historical perspective, the ideological struggle began when the British Crown arrived in Aotearoa, arranged the 1840 Treaty of Waitangi, and took legislative power of the nation (Crocket, 2012, p. 58; Kawharu, 1989; King, 2003). The system of governance that was created (and is maintained) privileges Euro-Western perspectives over indigenous ones (McLeod, 2009). It is heavily weighted towards the position of the Crown (Walker, 1990) and gives itself the power and authority to define what is considered normal (Consedine & Consedine, 2005; Lang, 2006). Over the past 179 years, this forceful process of colonisation has had a severe and detrimental effect on Māori. In a "profound silencing…of Māori epistemologies" (Hokowhitu, 2007, p. 70), sources of indigenous knowledge have been comprehensively displaced, made invisible, marginalised, and replaced by the mass of Euro-Western knowledge that has pervaded Aotearoa New Zealand (Gabel, 2013, p. 4). Indigenous healing practices and beliefs have been particularly targeted by colonial authorities (Durie, 2009; Niania et al., 2017). The Crown proclaims it has responsibility to "partner" with Māori (Crocket, 2009; Orange, 2012), but this has not been honoured in a way that could be considered equitable, right, or fair.

Although Māori are entitled to access mainstream (Euro-Western) health services (Love, 1999; Robertson, Haitana, Pitama, & Huriwai, 2006; Te Puni Kokiri, 1993), there have been many critics of the system's ability to meet the needs of Māori. This includes the field of counselling, which has not escaped criticism (Awatere, 1981; Drewery, 1990; Love, 1999; Te Wiata, 2006). Many have voiced

views around unfair distribution of power and resources. Māori health statistics reflect a space of marginalisation and unfair disadvantage within society; there is widespread evidence that minority indigenous populations across the globe suffer to a markedly greater degree from alcohol-related problems, youth suicide, depression, and post-traumatic conditions (Niania et al., 2017). They are then "treated" by the state, with interventions based on the assumed superiority of Western health and healing ideologies (McLeod, 2009, p. 287). According to Love (1999) this is "destructive and genocidal" for indigenous populations (p. viii). This may be especially true in medicalised settings, or where "evidence-based practices" are emphasised (A. Crocket, personal communication, February 20, 2019)—areas that may be more closely adherent to science-based Euro-Western approaches.

Māori have *always* resisted subjugation by a plethora of methods. As Gabel (2013) has argued, "resistance has been a consistent feature of our histories" (p. 9), defining resistance as "deliberate constructions within our society that have counter-acted the endeavors of western society to undermine our ideologies and practices" (p. 10). Over the last several decades, many groups have created visible frameworks, models, and structures that are based on Māori ways of thinking and being (Durie, 2012). This advance has been described as the "Māori renaissance" (Crocket, 2012, p. 59; Walker, 1990) and the tino rangatiratanga Māori sovereignty movement (Awatere, 1984). These efforts have brought the calls for greater self-determination by Māori into the public sphere in such a way that they can no longer be ignored.

Crocket (2009) has reminded us that the Crown and iwi are constructed as a binary partnership in most literature on the topic; this is unhelpful as it does not facilitate the conceptualisation of solutions to the problem. All knowledge and all identities are socially constructed in the context of human interaction (Somers, 1994). Each person in Aotearoa occupies various positions (Derrida, 1981) in the wide and varied social landscape, operating within unique space(s), drawing from myriad cultural ideas and identities in what Mila-Schaaf and Hudson (2009) describe as "endless patterns and arrangements of connection and difference across multiple spaces" (p. 8). Each person is in relationship to both Euro-Western and Māori cultures (King, 2003; Webber, 2008). Identities are produced in relational spaces which are inter-dependent, co-constructed and mediated in a multitude of ways. Cultural positions are not fixed, they are constantly negotiated. Perhaps, as

Crocket (2012) has suggested, Aotearoa has begun to shift away from Eurocentric monocultural governance, into what he has described as a "postcolonial phase," where the prominent discourses of colonisation have not yet been extinguished, but "new possibilities to navigate relationships are becoming available" (p. 205). Salmond (2017) has called Aotearoa New Zealand a site of cosmo-diversity, a place where multiple worlds engage and collide. It may be that solutions are being worked out all the time, but is there evidence of this in the literature?

The professional field of counselling has a responsibility to provide services that adequately meet the needs of clients (Lang, 2006). This article provides a review of the specific literature that identifies how well this is done. The review asked: Is the profession of counselling undertaking the work to critically examine its own practice, and relate appropriately to Māori, as required? This critical systematic literature review aimed to answer this by presenting key findings, discussing implications for the field, considering limitations of the review, and commenting on potential areas for future investigation.

Method

The research questions

The primary focus of the literature review was to explore how the profession of counselling in Aotearoa New Zealand treats its responsibility to meet the needs of clients who identify as Māori. It sought to investigate:

1. How are the needs of clients who identify as Māori conceptualised in the literature?
2. How is the responsibility of the counselling profession to meet Māori needs conceptualised in the literature?
3. How is the counselling profession's ability to operate culturally described in the literature?
4. How is bicultural practice in counselling relationships described in the literature?

Research design

My motivation to research this kaupapa (topic) was driven by my own experiences. For the last 10 years I have been employed full-time in a variety of counselling roles as a family/whānau therapist, a co-existing mental health and addictions

practitioner, and a family violence programme facilitator in mainstream and Māori health and/or social service agencies. I have experienced the challenges of supporting tangata whaiora (clients who identify as Māori) from within settings where Euro-Western models of ill health and/or dysfunction are privileged. Many times I have been frustrated, saddened, and in despair. Other times, I have seen successful relationships occur. These experiences inform my positioning in this research. I am also a bilingual, bicultural woman and mother, an aspiring academic, an artist, and a poet, influenced by both Euro-Western and indigenous knowledge. I freely admit that my "entanglement of…subjectivities" (Simmonds, 2009, p. 51) influences the research interaction and my understandings of it.

The aim of this critical systematic review was to explore descriptions of cultural viewpoints in counselling literature. A systematic literature review creates clearly defined research questions, focuses on studies relevant to the identified topic areas, and uses explicit methodology to evaluate, summarise, and interpret research written by academics, researchers, and practitioners (Khan, Kunz, Kleijnen, & Antes, 2003; Punch & Oancea, 2014). It is important that an extensive review of available literature is undertaken to ensure the identification of relevant work (Khan et al., 2003). To achieve this, the Discover search engine on the Massey University Library website; keyword-specific searches of EBSCOHOST; Academic Search Premier; and Google Scholar were utilised, as were local counselling journals and relevant Māori publications. Selected readings in related fields such as education, psychology, mental health, and psychiatry were reviewed for relevant material. For obvious reasons, there was a focus on Aotearoa New Zealand literature. Several international journals have published relevant work by local authors, so these were included as sources. New titles and authors in relevant fields were identified as the research was undertaken.

Specific search terms were used to identify key literature. These included *bicultural, whānau, community, Aotearoa, family, practice, indigenous, power,* and *class.* To narrow down the results to relevant literature, these terms were used in conjunction with each of the terms *Māori, Pākehā, Aotearoa, New Zealand,* and *counselling.* Local and international articles used *transcultural, cross-cultural, cultural safety, white, white privilege,* and *multicultural* to describe counselling issues pertaining to cultural groups. As the research continued, it was discovered that certain terms were used to describe the relationship between

settler and indigenous groups, such as *positioning, discourse, decolonisation, colonisation, agency, sovereignty, space, inclusion, exclusion, historical trauma,* and *intergenerational trauma.* A snowball sampling method was used to search relevant books and articles (Punch & Oancea, 2014) from the reference lists of key sources. There were no limitations placed round the date of publication, as the scope of available scholarly work was limited, and some of the most important sources were not the most recently published.

Results of the literature search

Almost without exception the search results were related to local literature, or literature that had been published in international publications with respect to the Aotearoa New Zealand setting. There was less information available than expected, and an almost total lack of empirical studies available. Indeed, all of the sources uncovered by this search were descriptive.

The criteria for inclusion were that the work must be relevant to the field of counselling in the context of Aotearoa New Zealand, and include discussion of the impact of culture. A total of 25 sources were identified as significant according to these criteria. Some were useful for answering more than one question, and therefore fell into more than one category. No sources shared a focus across all areas.

The literature review

For the purposes of this review the term "counsellor" is used to describe individuals who have usually (but not always) undertaken specialist tertiary qualifications in counselling. The process of counselling is defined as the aim of assisting clients with personal thinking, behaviour, and emotional expression, in their relationships with self and others (Durie, 1989; Durie & Hermansson, 1990). Counsellors in Aotearoa New Zealand typically deliver therapeutic interventions to individuals, whānau (families), and/or groups in community settings such as (but not limited to) health, social service, and education settings. They may be members of the New Zealand Association of Counsellors (NZAC) or other professional registration bodies.

This review focused on four main areas: what clients who identify as Māori need from counselling; the responsibility of the profession to meet the needs of Māori; the way the profession operates with respect to culture; and finally, work

by counsellors who discuss the process of navigating culture in the context of bicultural practice.

What Māori clients need

Māori need services that meet Māori needs (Durie, 1989). Unfortunately, there are a limited number of sources that describe what Māori needs are and how they can be met. Few practitioners working in the field identify as Māori. Few counselling resources based on Māori epistemologies have been developed, and what does exist may not be represented in the literature. As Houkamau and Sibley wrote in 2011, there has not been any quantitative research to test the application of Māori models of wellbeing in health service delivery.

What do Māori clients need? Ten sources that discussed this were identified (Awatere, 1981; Crocket, Davis, Kotze, Swann, & Swann, 2017; Hepi & Denton, 2010; Kerr-Bell, 2004; Durie, 1989; Love, 1999; Niania et al., 2017; Pere, 1997; Piripi & Body, 2010; Swann, Swann, & Crocket, 2013). There was general agreement that effective counselling for Māori clients should utilise knowledge drawn from Māori epistemologies. Several sources related that knowledge and understandings from both Euro-Western and Māori bodies of knowledge during assessment and treatment would be more beneficial to clients than the prevailing Euro-Western approach alone (Crocket et al., 2017; Hepi & Denton, 2010; Niania et al., 2017; Piripi & Body, 2010; Swann et al., 2013). The literature identified that Māori clients are likely to be more responsive when the counselling process is adapted to utilise relevant Māori concepts (Piripi & Body, 2010), such as whakapapa (relationships to the natural world and other people) (Swann et al., 2013), mana wāhine (Māori conceptualisation of the inherent worth of wāhine/women), pūrākau (teaching/learning in the form of stories, waiata/song and whakataukī/proverbial wisdom) (Crocket et al., 2017), mauri (life force), wairua (spirituality), and mana (the spiritual authority, energy, or power embodied in a person or whānau) (Niania et al., 2017).

While some authors have made the claim that only Māori can or should work with Māori (Awatere, 1984), this brings up questions of what or who qualifies as Māori and what or who is not, which is a topic beyond the scope of this study. From a pragmatic point of view this stance is often simply not an option. There are fewer professionals who identify as Māori than would be needed to adequately

serve the needs of the population. Also, the systems that deliver the services remain largely predicated on Euro-Western systems of operating, regardless of the ethnic background of practitioners. However, it was found that useful Māori models of practice are available and explained in a clear and accessible way (Durie, 1998; Pere, 1997), and could be more extensively drawn on by mainstream services, but remain underutilised (Love, 1999). One study (specific to counselling) was found that identified strategies that could be utilised by non-Māori counsellors to facilitate engagement with Māori clients. Respectful language, a warm approach, and the inclusion of culturally relevant posters or objects in the physical environment may be useful; the absence of these constitutes a potential barrier to client engagement according to Kerr-Bell (2004). Alastair Crocket (personal communication, February 20, 2019) offers that as an educator he found Brent Swann's elucidation of waewae tapu (in Swann et al., 2013) the single most helpful addition to this.

The responsibility of the counselling profession to meet the needs of Māori

There were seven sources identified that discussed the responsibility of the counselling profession to meet Māori needs (Addy, 2008; Crocket et al., 2017; Kerr-Bell, 2004; Love, 1999; Mulqueeney, 2012; Piripi & Body, 2010; Swann et al., 2013).

It is disappointing to see that counselling literature, for the most part, treats Māori as "other," a Māori client or concept a special event, rather than a normal part of working with the people of Aotearoa. Kerr-Bell's (2004) study clearly indicates that cultural factors may be a barrier to Māori engagement. Language used by the counsellor, counsellor attitudes, and physical environments that privilege Western objects and art may make Māori feel uncomfortable. These issues must be occurring in certain spaces and settings, otherwise they would not have been commented on by the research participants. This is concerning. Piripi and Body (2010) believe that, overall, the "cultural aspect" of counselling relationships is "largely and systematically overlooked, underrated, or possibly derailed" (p. 36). According to Addy (2008) non-Māori groups and services occupy a position of power and privilege, and often fail to recognise the impact this has on relationships (Consedine & Consedine, 2005). Unconscious and unexamined notions of white supremacy may be present in the attitudes of people (hooks, 2013), "the invisible white elephant" as Mulqueeney (2012) has described it, impacting on counsellor capacity to engage appropriately with Māori (Addy, 2008; Lago, 2006; Love, 1999;

Tuckwell, 2006). It is difficult to gauge how non-Māori contributors view the struggle to meet Māori needs, due to the paucity of papers on the topic.

While mainstream counselling literature does not appear to discuss what Māori need to any significant extent, there are some notable exceptions to this. With a strong social-justice focus, seeking to identify ways that non-Māori may be able to appropriately work with Māori was the specific focus of Crocket's thesis (2010). Other valuable sources that provided alternative viewpoints of conscious and deliberate bicultural counselling practice leading to therapeutic efficacy were found. For example, Swann et al. (2013) raise questions about the ways in which "whakapapa narratives" shape and might further shape contemporary counselling practices (p. 13). While the focus of the article is "the particular whānau therapy practices which Huia and Brent have shaped through multiple forms of connectedness," these practices are held within a rich and extended whakapapa (system of meaning), "within counselling and beyond" (p. 13). A book published later (incorporating the work of the same authors alongside others) greatly expanded on these themes, offering many rich insights into an approach that draws heavily on Māori culture, philosophy, and experience (Crocket et al., 2017). The collaborative work of Niania et al. (2017) provides an example of the incredible benefits that forging relationships between practitioners from differing cultural backgrounds can bring for clients, the professionals themselves, and the health system itself.

How the counselling profession is operating with respect to biculturalism

Though it appears from the literature that incremental shifts towards bicultural practice are occurring, several authors have highlighted areas of challenge for the profession. Love (1999) has criticised ideas such as "cultural sensitivity," feeling they have been added on to existing ways of operating and have minimal effect on the theory and practice still largely dominated by Euro-Western ideas. Rogers (2012) agreed that initially, tokenistic gestures were employed by health services as a nod to Māori without any meaningful shift in the way services have been delivered. It may still be difficult for members of the dominant group (those who identify strongly with Euro-Western cultural values) to share power, given they are enveloped in and benefit from occupying a privileged cultural position (Addy, 2008; Mulqueeney, 2012). Lang (2006) has related that unequal and unfair power relationships are the issue, and non-Māori must initiate repair of the

damage done by colonial practices. They can do this by choosing to shift from a position of "dominant coloniser" to "equal partner" (p. 557). The regulatory body and education system that provides guidance and training to counsellors has an important role in supporting these shifts.

The counselling profession

Six papers discussed the way NZAC describes its obligation to partner with Māori (Crocket, 2009, 2010, 2012, 2013; Crocket et al., 2013; Lang, 2006). NZAC is the largest and most widely recognised professional organisation for counsellors, effectively regulating the practice of counselling in New Zealand (Rogers, 2012). The first stated objective of the association is to "promote effective counselling services that are consistent with obligations under the Treaty of Waitangi" (NZAC, 2019a). Its Code of Ethics (NZAC, 2016, p. 3) requires counsellors to "actively support the principles embodied in the Treaty of Waitangi." This is a change in wording from the 2002 version, which asks counsellors to "seek to be informed about the meaning and implications of the Treaty of Waitangi for their work" (NZAC, 2002, p. 2). In any case, it is not entirely clear how or where counsellors are to undertake these things, who will benefit if they do, and who would be disadvantaged if they do not. Crocket (2013) notes that NZAC does not offer many suggestions, although engaging in the Puawānanga Kaitiakitanga process (formerly cultural supervision) is now a compulsory part of the process to obtain full member status (NZAC, 2019b).

Crocket (2009) comments on some of the work NZAC had been doing to acknowledge Māori, such as "incorporating Māori tīkanga in meetings, offering workshops and using te reo Māori in newsletters" (p. 69). A Māori rōpū (group of registered NZAC counsellors who identify as Māori) exists, although no mention of this could easily be found when I checked the NZAC website just prior to the publication of this article. NZAC newsletters (for counsellors) offer some detail around the work of the association's Te Ahi Kaa, Gaye Puketapu-Andrews (A. Crocket, personal communication, February 20, 2019), although these were not easily available on the website either.

NZAC's (2015) policy document on supervision contains two references to culture. It is suggested in section 4.1 that supervision includes "cultural perspectives," and in section 5.2, "focused reflection on…systemic and cultural

issues affecting [counselling] interactions" (p. 2). The previous version of this document contained only one reference to culture, encouraging but not requiring cultural consultation for members who work "with a person of a different background from their own" (s 5.5., 2008, cited in Crocket et al., 2013, p. 70). There is no definition of what constitutes an acceptable level of counsellor understanding and/or ability in the area of bicultural practice and/or supervision; the word "bicultural" is not mentioned in the *Code of Ethics*. It appears the onus is on individual counsellors to take personal responsibility. It is unclear from the literature to what extent this is occurring.

Counsellor education programmes in Aotearoa New Zealand

Six sources described the way counsellor education programmes incorporate bicultural teaching and learning ideas (Crocket et al., 2017; Flintoff & Rivers, 2012; Goldson & Fletcher, 2004; Karena, 2012; Lang & Gardiner, 2013; Lewis & Cheshire, 2007). Indoctrinating culture is an educative process (Harker & McConnochie, 1985). Knowledge translates to power (Foucault, 1980) yet it is possible to change the way power is distributed by changing the way knowledge is defined and transmitted (Foucault, 1982). Most counsellors are trained in mainstream tertiary institutions, which are underpinned by Euro-Western ideas about what constitutes knowledge. Graduate counsellors are leaving training institutions to work with a diverse population in the field, but are they adequately prepared for this? Can graduating counsellors provide "culturally responsive forms of treatment" (Sue & Zane, 1987, p. 37)?

There is evidence in the literature of efforts to combine approaches in counsellor education settings, to provide bicultural training opportunities. Goldson and Fletcher (2004) undertook research into why non-Māori appeared to be reluctant to work with Māori concepts, and found students may be afraid of saying or doing the wrong thing. In response to this, they developed a model to teach students about what it means to be in a cultural partnership. The model was based on frank dialogue, cooperation, and consensus-making, with a deliberate incorporation of Māori concepts of teaching and learning. The authors report that students experienced high levels of satisfaction with the model. Lewis and Cheshire (2007) provide another account of utilising Māori thinking in teaching and learning processes, noting how this clashed with the "status quo." Flintoff and

Rivers (2012) describe reworking a counsellor education programme to do more than simply require cultural sensitivities from graduates (p. 235). They interwove indigenous models with Western theory and practice, each purportedly given equal validity.

Lang and Gardiner (2013, p. 8) present "collaborative pluralism"—a conceptual framework that seeks to exist in the space where cultures intersect, termed by Lang (2012) the "liminal space." This model requires counsellors to deconstruct from positions of cultural dominance and reconstruct as "pluralists," with a collaborative approach (p. 8). The client-centred notion of metacommunication—the process of continuous dialogue with the client in order to determine the goals and methods of the therapeutic work—is put forth as best practice, encouraging counsellors to check throughout the counselling process that what is occurring is being experienced by the client as useful. Karena (2012) discusses a framework developed to support student understanding of the impacts of historical intergenerational trauma as a result of colonisation. This was developed in a kaupapa Māori counselling setting. It is regrettable that similar concepts have not been mentioned in commentary on any mainstream counselling education programmes, although this may occur in future.

There is some acknowledgement in these sources that culture is an active and complex influence upon relationships and that careful negotiation is needed. There is agreement that counsellor education programmes must undertake self-review to expand and incorporate "other" ways of teaching and learning.

Bicultural practice

Seven publications examined bicultural practice in a range of counselling settings, offering a small variety of perspectives from a handful of experienced practitioners: practice (Crocket et al., 2017; Hepi & Denton, 2010; Mulqueeney, 2012; Niania et al., 2017); supervision (Crocket et al., 2013, 2017); and research (Crocket, 2012; Waters & Crocket, 2011). All sources explicitly acknowledged the position of power that counsellors hold in the relationship and each engaged in discussion of how they negotiated the "space" (Smith et al., 2008) between counsellor and client.

Hepi and Denton (2010) identified a "bicultural" practitioner as one who draws upon divergent identities. The bringing together of Euro-Western and Māori conceptual thinking in Hepi's work is an interesting example of one

practitioner's unique style of creative bicultural practice. It describes, using specific examples, the incorporation of whakaaro Māori (Māori thinking) into his work with clients, and the benefit this has. Mulqueeney (2012), as a non-Māori counsellor, provides another useful example of bicultural practice in his auto-ethnographical description of reflexive work with Māori clients. Crocket et al. (2017) provide many rich examples of collaborative bicultural knowledge and relationships, claiming the book as "Māori space…at the heart of this book are accounts of Māori cultural ethics at work in counselling" (p. 21) and providing specific chapters with a focus on teaching, learning, and supervision. The work of Niania et al. (2017) is also unique in that it was co-created by the authors and the clients they were working with.

Waters and Crocket (2011) deliberately negotiate the cultural landscape in counselling and research. Waters admits "little understanding of what it is like to cross a bridge daily between different cultural beliefs and practices" (p. 17), as many people who identify with cultural groups defined as "other" have no choice but to do. She commits to self-review and critical analysis with respect to deliberate consideration of culture and the way it works upon relationships. In research undertaken with five Pākehā counsellors, Crocket (2012) concludes that placing Māori clients in the position of "other" needs to be reviewed by non-Māori professionals. This literature pertaining to bicultural practice in counselling settings is particularly useful, as the impact culture has on the therapeutic relationships is directly addressed and applied to practice—rather than remaining invisible, ignored, or hidden.

Overall discussion

This review concerned itself with what counselling-related literature has to offer in terms of understanding how to meet the needs of Māori clients and conceptualising bicultural practices that may work to meet those needs. I originally undertook this systematic literature review in partial fulfilment of the Master of Counselling degree at Massey University in 2015. Since then, two major books on therapeutic approaches for Māori clients have been published (Crocket et al., 2017; Niania et al., 2017) offering "a significant contribution to the literature on Māori identity and Māori-centred therapies within a narrative and bicultural framework" (Connor, 2017, p. 128). Prior to the publication of these books, there was even less to work with—pertinent literature was almost exclusively limited to what could be

found in journal articles.

Although there is disappointingly little useful exploration of what Māori might need from counselling, several different viewpoints were represented (Awatere, 1981; Crocket et al., 2017; Durie, 2007; Hepi & Denton, 2010; Kerr-Bell, 2004; Love, 1999; Niania et al., 2017; Pere, 1997; Piripi & Body, 2010; Swann et al., 2013). It is interesting to note the increasingly collaborative and bicultural nature of some of the publications. The papers reviewed highlight some of the differences in conceptual thinking between Euro-Western and Māori worldviews. There has been some development of models and resources, based upon (or incorporating) Māori epistemologies, but more suggestions on how counsellors could incorporate these into practice would add value.

There is little acknowledgement in the literature of the responsibility of mainstream counselling services to meet Māori needs, or of the apparent struggle of the profession to operate biculturally. Māori authors comment on the lack of consideration of Māori viewpoints in Euro-Western theory, practice, and research, but except for those discussed here, few papers authored by non-Māori acknowledge this or offer suggestions on how this imbalance could be addressed. Perhaps mainstream counsellors are not aware that current clinical practice is rooted in an unfair system, which locates Euro-Western notions as superior, and Māori notions as "inferior" and "less than" (Consedine & Consedine, 2005). Perhaps they lack the language or tools to identify and discuss their own difficulties or the difficulties of the profession in this area (Addy, 2008; Lago, 2006; Love, 1999). Or it may be that the efforts that are being made could be communicated more clearly in the literature and on resources such as the NZAC website.

It is possible that many counsellors in Aotearoa New Zealand have done significant work to invoke the "spirit of partnership" Crocket (2012, p. 63) talks about. Indeed, Alistair Crocket (personal communication, February 20, 2019) suggests that the lack of literature available may be due to counselling being introduced to Aotearoa as a craft—"a set of practices to be absorbed and utilised—without a focus on research or publication." However, in reflecting on this, he notes that "developments in practice are invisible if they are not recorded or researched…hopes, intentions and developments are of limited value if they are not more widely known." Despite a traditionally limited focus on research, the field of counselling may indeed benefit from review and reflection.

Even when there is published literature, there appears to be a lack of consensus or coherence in uptake. For example, the literature describes several examples of adjustments to the delivery of counsellor education to facilitate enhanced student understanding of bicultural relationships. However, there is no general consensus on what exactly this is, what the goals are, or how any changes in attitudes or practice may be measured. No literature examines what else might be needed to prepare counsellors adequately to manage culture within counselling relationships in a safe and effective manner. It must also be noted that many of the large tertiary institutions providing counsellor education programmes are silent in the literature. What is happening in those programmes? What shifts are they making, if any?

Limitations of this review

This section discusses the limitations of the studies included in this literature review, and the limitations pertaining to the review itself. Punch (2009) outlines the five main stages of carrying out a literature review as, "searching, screening, summarizing and documenting, organizing-analyzing-synthesizing, and writing" (p. 93). The screening process used in this review may have limited the results, as the choice was made to exclude certain sources for various reasons (e.g. only sources accessible freely via the university access agreements were used, rather than those requiring a paid subscription). Literature that related to counselling in Aotearoa was focused on closely. It may be that papers from the related disciplines of social work or nursing would have elicited different findings. While attempts were made to find robust studies, there may have been some that were overlooked through human error.

None of the studies brought together discussion on all aspects of the research questions. There needs to be more research undertaken on what Māori clients need, and how mainstream counselling services can meet these needs. It is evident that Māori models of practice are available, but there is no prescriptive literature outlining how these could be utilised to inform working models for mainstream counselling practice. Ongoing investigation of the impact of culture on counselling practice and relationships is an important area that requires further research—investigation with a much greater level of focus and rigour.

Recommendations for future research

Mezirow (1990) has highlighted the importance of discarding the concepts of

"correct" and "incorrect" ways of thinking in order to find conciliation. Mutually beneficial relationships are possible, if we move beyond thinking focused on binary opposites (Euro-Western vs Māori). It would be interesting to find out what the barriers to bicultural practice for mainstream professionals are. What do counsellors themselves feel is missing, or needs development in order to provide more appropriate services?

What other understandings are lacking? Karena (2012) developed a framework to facilitate student counsellor understanding of the impacts of historical intergenerational trauma (trauma that has and is occurring as a result of colonisation). It could be adapted for use in other education programmes to facilitate counsellor awareness of the impact colonial processes have had on relationships in Aotearoa. It is unfortunate that according to the literature reviewed, these concepts appear to be primarily being shared in kaupapa Māori settings (organisations based on Māori values and ways of doing, catering primarily to Māori students). There would be a great deal of value in developing them for use in mainstream settings.

I have seen detailed and useful accounts of biculturalism in practice by collaborating practitioners. This leads me to ask: What further room is there for reclamation, the recovery of traditional indigenous healing practices, and their utilisation in new and contemporary contexts? If research into the ways whānau Māori (families) have been resisting Euro-Western healing ideologies was conducted, what would the findings be? With the recent publication of two robust books on Māori-centred therapy (Crocket et al., 2017; Niania et al., 2017), the concept of healing has become an important site of resistance for bicultural practitioners. A strong whakaaro (way of thinking) has emerged that recognises the marginalisation of indigenous systems of healing, and the importance of reclaiming and utilising this knowledge. Physical, mental, and spiritual function are the most significant and defining aspects of our lives—where else is space created for Māori ideologies, Māori practitioners, rongoā māori (therapies based on indigenous knowledge), and expanded Māori models of wellbeing? What would health services that adequately take into consideration the strengths, sufferings, needs, dreams, and aspirations of those who identify as Māori look like?

Conclusion

Mataira (1995) has argued that biculturalism cannot be taught, instead it needs to be lived and experienced. According to Mila-Schaaf (2010), "cultural complexity is never solved or completely resolved but constantly negotiated in temporal time- context- and purpose-specific ways" (p. 34). There is evidence that this is occurring in the field of counselling across a range of space(s) and place(s) and relationships. It may be, in 21st-century Aotearoa, that neither Euro-Western nor Māori systems of knowledge have all the answers, but together they can serve the needs of a bicultural population. If they continued to be brought together, there would be no "other." All parties would be present—in a profession that truly invoked a spirit of partnership.

Acknowledgement

I am indebted to Alastair Crocket for his feedback on a draft of this article.

References

Addy, N. (2008). White privilege and cultural racism: Effects on the counselling process. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 28(1), 10–23.

Awatere, D. (1981). Māori counselling. In F. Donnelly (Ed.), A time to talk: Counsellor and counselled (pp. 198–202). Sydney, Australia: Allen & Unwin.

Awatere, D. (1984). Mäori sovereignty. Auckland, New Zealand: Broadsheet.

Brown, S., Clark, P., Gilling, M., & Waitere, H. (2008). Through the eye of the needle pass the multiple threads of biculturalism. In A. George, S. Brown, & J. O'Neill (Eds.), Facing the big questions in teaching: Purpose, power and learning. South Melbourne, Australia: Cengage Learning.

Connor, H. (2017). Book review: Moemoeā Māori counselling journeys. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 37(2), 68–86. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/journal/book_review1.pdf

Consedine, R., & Consedine, J. (2005). Healing our history: The challenge of the Treaty of Waitangi. Auckland, New Zealand: Penguin Books.

Crocket, A. (2009). Interpreting "partnership" as a core value: Some implications of the Treaty of Waitangi for the NZAC code of ethics. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 29(2), 61–71.

Crocket, A. (2010). Päkeha counsellors explore their positioning: Towards postcolonial praxis (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). The University of Waikato, Hamilton, New Zealand.

Crocket, A. (2012). Cultural safety: Towards postcolonial counselling practice? British Journal of Guidance and Counselling, 40(3), 205–220.

Crocket, A. (2013). Exploring the meaning of the Treaty of Waitangi for counselling. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 33(1), 54–67.

Crocket, K., Davis, E., Kotze, E., Swann, B., & Swann, H. (2017). Moemoeä: Mäori counselling journeys. Auckland, New Zealand: Dunmore Publishing Ltd.

Crocket, K., Flanagan, P., Alford, Z., Allen, J., Baird, J., Bruce, A., … Swann, H. (2013). Supervision and culture: Meetings at thresholds. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 33(1), 68–86.

Derrida, J. (1981). Positions (A. Bass, Trans.). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Drewery, W. (1990.) Hearing, listening and power relations: The problem of delivering unconditional positive regard. New Zealand Association Counsellors Journal, 12(1), 27–37.

Durie, M. (1989). A move that's well overdue: Shaping counselling to meet the needs of Māori people. New Zealand Counselling and Guidance Association Journal, 2(1), 13–23.

Durie, M. (1998). Whaiora: Māori health development (2nd ed.). Australia: Oxford University Press.

Durie, M. (2009). Māori knowledge and medical science: The interface between psychiatry and traditional healing in New Zealand. In M. Incayawar, R. Wintrob, & L. Bouchard (Eds.), Psychiatrists and traditional healers: Unwitting partners in global mental health (pp. 237–249). Chichester, England: John Wiley & Sons.

Durie, M. (2012). Kaupapa Māori: Shifting the social. New Zealand Journal of Educational Studies, 47(2), 21–29.

Durie, M., & Hermansson, G. (1990). Counselling Māori people in New Zealand [Aotearoa]. International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling, 13(4): 107–118.

Flintoff, V. J., & Rivers, S. (2012). A reshaping of counselling curriculum: Responding to the changing (bi)cultural context. British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, 40(3), 235–246. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2012.678290

Foucault, M. (1980). The confession of the flesh. In C. Gordon (Ed.), Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings by Michael Foucault. New York, NY: Pantheon.

Foucault, M. (1982). The subject and power. Critical Inquiry, 8(4), 777–795.

Gabel, K. A. (2013). Poipoia te tamaiti ki te ūkaipō (Doctoral dissertation). The University of Waikato, Hamilton, New Zealand. Retrieved from https://researchcommons.waikato.ac.nz/handle/10289/7986

Goldson, J., & Fletcher, T. R. (2004). Training for bicultural interventions with families. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 25(2), 33–43.

Harker, R. K., & McConnochie, K. R. (1985). Education as a cultural artifact:

Studies in Māori and aboriginal education. Palmerston North, New Zealand: Dunmore Press.

Hepi, T., & Denton, E. (2010). Secular science meets sacred art: The bi-cultural work of Tangi Hepi. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 30(2), 1–22.

Hokowhitu, B. (2007). The silencing of Māori men: Deconstructing a "space" for Māori masculinities. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 27(2), 63–76.

hooks, bell. (2013). Writing beyond race: Living theory and practice. New York, NY/Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

Houkamau, C. A., & Sibley, C. G. (2011). Māori cultural efficacy and subjective wellbeing: A psychological model and research agenda. Social Indicators Research, 103, 379–398.

Karena, R. W. (2012). Takitoru: From parallel to partnership. A ritual of engagement based on Te Tiriti o Waitangi for implementing safe cultural practice in Māori counselling and social science. Mai Journal, 1(1), 61–75. Retrieved from http://www.journal.mai.ac.nz/sites/default/files/MAI_Journal_v1%2C1_WaretiniKarena_0.pdf

Kawharu, I. H. (Ed.). (1989). Waitangi: Maori and Pakeha perspectives of the Treaty of Waitangi. Auckland, New Zealand: Oxford University Press.

Kerr-Bell, R. T. (2004). Māori, identity and counselling (Unpublished master's thesis). Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Khan, K. S., Kunz R., Kleijnen, J., & Antes, G. (2003). Systematic reviews to support evidence-based medicine: How to review and apply findings of health care research. London, England: RSM Press.

King, M. (2003). The Penguin history of New Zealand. Auckland, New Zealand: Penguin Books.

Lago, C. (2006). Race, culture and counselling: The ongoing challenge (2nd ed.). Maidenhead, England: Open University Press.

Lang, S. K. W. (2006). "Decolonialism" and the counselling profession: The Aotearoa/New Zealand experience. International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling, 4, 557–572. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10447-005-8491-2

Lang, S. K. W. (2012). Notes at a conference, CEAD 2010: Transversing the liminal. Cultural Studies Critical Methodologies, XX(X), 1–8.

Lang, S. K. W., & Gardiner, B. D. (2013). As they like it—culture-centred counsellor education in the context of Aotearoa New Zealand: A play on bicultural pluralism. British Journal of Guidance and Counselling. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2013.824949

Lewis, D., & Cheshire, A. (2007). Te Whakaakoha: Teaching and learning as one. Journal of Systemic Therapies, 26(3), 43–56.

Love, C. M. A. (1999). Mäori voices in the construction of indigenous models of counselling theory and practice (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Mataira, P. (1995). Bicultural wisdom: Navigating the bicultural seas. Te Komako, Social Work Review, 7(1), 9–10.

McLeod, J. (2009). Introduction to counselling (4th ed.). Maidenhead, England: Open University Press.

Mila-Schaaf, K. (2010). Polycultural capital and the Pasifika second generation: Negotiating identities in diasporic spaces (Doctoral dissertation). Massey University, Albany, New Zealand. Retrieved from https://mro.massey.ac.nz/bitstream/handle/10179/1713/02_whole.pdf

Mila-Schaaf, K., & Hudson, M. (2009). Negotiating space for indigenous theorising in Pacific mental health and addictions. Auckland, New Zealand: Le Va Pasifika in Te Pou.

Mezirow, J. (1990). Transformation theory of adult learning. In T. Guy (Ed.), Providing culturally relevant adult education: A challenge for the twenty first century. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Mulqueeney, N. (2012). Tumeke bro'?: A personal reflection of a male white counsellor working with male Māori tamariki. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 32(1), 56–67.

New Zealand Association of Counsellors. (2002). Code of ethics. Hamilton, New Zealand: New Zealand Association of Counsellors. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/ethics.cfm

New Zealand Association of Counsellors. (2015) [2008]. Supervision. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/viewobj.cfm?file_name=supervision1.pdf&objID=1675

New Zealand Association of Counsellors. (2016). Code of ethics. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/ethics.cfm

New Zealand Association of Counsellors. (2019a). Objectives. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/objectives.cfm

New Zealand Association of Counsellors. (2019b). Application packs: Full membership. Retrieved from http://www.nzac.org.nz/application_packs_full_membership.cfm

Niania, W., Bush, A., & Epston, D. (2017). Collaborative and indigenous mental health therapy: Tātaihono—stories of Māori healing and psychiatry. New York, NY: Routledge.

Orange, C. (2012). The Treaty of Waitangi. Retrieved from http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/treaty-of-waitangi

Pere, R. T. P. (1997). Te wheke: A celebration of infinite wisdom (2nd ed.). Gisborne, New Zealand: Ao Ako Global Learning New Zealand.

Piripi, T., & Body, V. (2010). Tihei-wa mauri ora. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 30(1), 34–46.

Punch, K. (2009). Introduction to research methods in education. London, United Kingdom: Sage Publications Ltd.

Punch, K. F., & Oancea, A. (2014). Introduction to research methods in education (2nd ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Robertson, P. J., Haitana, T. N., Pitama, S. G., & Huriwai, T. T. (2006). A review of work-force development literature for the Māori addiction treatment field in Aotearoa/New Zealand. Drug and Alcohol Review, 25, 233–239. https://doi.org/10.1080/09595230600644707

Rogers, N. (2012). Shifting landscapes of counselling identities in Aotearoa New Zealand. British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, 40(3), 191–204.

Royal Commission on Social Policy. (1988). The April report (Vol. 2). Wellington, New Zealand: Government Printer.

Salmond, A. (2017). Tears of Rangi: Experiments across worlds. Auckland, New Zealand: Auckland University Press.

Simmonds, N. (2009). Mäori wahine geographies: Spiritual, spatial and embodied understandings of Papatüänuku (Master's thesis). The

University of Waikato, Hamilton, New Zealand. Retrieved from https://researchcommons.waikato.ac.nz/handle/10289/2798

Smith, L. T., Hudson, M., Hemi, M., Tiakiwai, S. Joseph, R., Barrett, A., & Dunn, M. (2008). The negotiated space. Unpublished paper Te Hau Mihi Ata: Mātauranga Māori, Science and Technology.

Somers, M. (1994). The narrative construction of identity: A relational and network approach. Theory and Society, 23, 605–649. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00992905

Sue, S., & Zane, N. (1987). The role of culture and cultural techniques in psychotherapy. American Psychologist, 42, 37–45. https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.42.1.37

Swann, B., Swann, H., & Crocket, K. (2013). Whakapapa narratives and whānau therapy. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 33(2), 12–30.

Te Puni Kōkiri (1993). Ngä iao te Oranga Hinengaro *Māori: Trends in Māori mental health*. Wellington, New Zealand: Te Puni Kōkiri.

Te Wiata, J. (2006). A local Aotearoa New Zealand investigation of the contribution of Mäori cultural knowledges to Päkehä identity and counselling practices (Unpublished master's thesis). The University of Waikato, Hamilton, New Zealand.

Tuckwell, G. (2006). Specific issues for white counsellors. In C. Lago (Ed.), Race, culture and counselling: The ongoing challenge (2nd ed., pp. 204–216). Maidenhead, England: Open University Press.

Walker, R. (1990). Ka Whawhai Tonu Mätou: Struggle without end. Auckland, New Zealand: Penguin Books.

Waters, A., & Crocket, K. (2011). Research for counselling practice: Bridging between cultures. New Zealand Journal of Counselling, 31(1), 16–31.

Webber, M. (2008). Walking the space between: Identity and Mäori/Päkehä. Wellington, New Zealand: NZCER Press.